



**DA**

ONE NATION. ONE FUTURE

**CABINET  
REPORT CARD**

**2008**

## CABINET SCORECARD

Department	Cabinet member	Score		
		2006	2007	2008
President	Kgalema Motlanthe (new)	5	4	8 (provisional)
Deputy President	Baleka Mbete (new)	6.5	7	7 (provisional)
Minister in the President's Office	Manto Tshabalala-Msimang (new)	5	3	4 (provisional)
Arts & Culture	Pallo Jordan	3	5	5
Communications	Ivy Matsepe-Casaburi	4	3	1
Correctional Services	Ngconde Balfour	2	3	1
Defence	Charles Nqakula (new)	4	5	3 (provisional)
Education	Naledi Pandor	4	5	7
Environmental Affairs & Tourism	Marthinus van Schalkwyk	5	6	6
Finance	Trevor Manuel	7	6	7
Foreign Affairs	Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma	6	3	2
Health	Barbara Hogan (new)	0	0	8 (provisional)
Home Affairs	Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula	2	2	1
Housing	Lindiwe Sisulu	3	5	4
Intelligence	Siyabonga Cwele (new)	4	5	6 (provisional)
Justice & Constitutional Development	Enver Surty (new)	3	4	7 (provisional)
Labour	Membathisi Mdladlana	2	4	2
Land and Agriculture	Lulu Xingwana	5	3	2
Minerals & Energy	Buyelwa Sonjica	6	3	4
Provincial & Local Government	Shiceka Sicelo (new)	5	6	5 (provisional)
Public Enterprises	Brigitte Mabandla (new)	5	4	4 (provisional)
Public Service & Administration	Richard Baloyi (new)	3	4	5 (provisional)
Public Works	Geoff Doidge (new)	4	5	8 (provisional)
Safety and Security	Nathi Mthethwa (new)	2	4	3 (provisional)
Science & Technology	Mosibudi Mangena	7	7	8
Social Development	Zola Skweyiya	4	5	6
Sport & Recreation	Makhenkhesi Stofile	6	7	3
Trade & Industry	Mandisi Mpahlwa	4	3	2
Transport	Jeff Radebe	5	5	4
Water Affairs & Forestry	Lindiwe Hendricks	6	4	5

## INTRODUCTION

As ordinary South Africans raise their families, educate themselves and try to keep their household budgets balanced, they are affected in these tasks in a multitude of ways by the decisions made by the thirty individuals who make up South Africa's Cabinet.

Our individual efforts to pursue our dreams can be encouraged, or equally easily squashed, by good or bad decisions made by these powerful people on anything from housing subsidies to the VAT rate to medicines procurement. One example of poor leadership stands out from this year's news; poor management of health care left clinics in the Eastern Cape without rehydration formula, with the consequence that over 100 young lives were destroyed.

Because their decisions filter down to all of our lives, it is unarguable that the individuals who are awarded Cabinet positions must be the most able people that it is possible to find. Every year the DA evaluates those who have been given places in the Cabinet to determine how well they have lived up to their enormous responsibilities, and scores them on their performance.

This year, the post-Polokwane change in the ruling party's leadership led to almost a third of Cabinet members changing. In some cases, the changes were inspired, and the DA has awarded provisional scores of 8 to three members of the new Cabinet and one old member, when in previous years no one had scored higher than 7.

While new Cabinet appointments have only had a little over two months in which to prove themselves, some are already showing an ability and willingness to throw out the baggage of their predecessors and get stuck into making their roles work.

Scoring 8 for his performance so far is President Kgalema Motlanthe, whose temperateness and reasonableness helped to create a much needed sense of stability during a tense changeover period. No bones have been made about the fact that he is a place-holder. But his principled response to humanitarian crises elsewhere on the continent, his measured response to the global financial crisis and his willingness to consider several matters of key importance suggest that ejecting him from leadership next year would be South Africa's loss.

He was well supported in this by our new Deputy President, Baleka Mbete, who has adopted a cooperative approach and done well in focusing on some of South Africa's major problems.

One of the most notable of the new arrivals is obviously the new Minister of Health, who has wasted no time in discarding Aids denialism, opening up communication links and working to restore some sense of order to a department which had lost all coherence.

Of the old Cabinet members, the most remarkable score improvement was earned by Education Minister Naledi Pandor. Last year the DA accused her of tough talk but little action. This was not the case this year, and the minister took some educational bulls by the horns with programmes to address some tough problems that were conspicuously ducked by her predecessors – in particular teacher performance, learner discipline and the lack of accountability within the system as a whole. If she is able to follow through with these, a new generation of South African children can expect much improved educational prospects.

Trevor Manuel, whose rumoured resignation saw the Johannesburg Securities Exchange top 40 index to drop by almost 4 percent, continued with his prudent macroeconomic path, despite a public and powerful populist attack on these policies. He maintained his high 7 score from last year.

On the other hand, some of the new appointments were inadvisable, to say the least. Shifting former Health Minister to the President's Office, for example, might have stopped her from doing any further damage to the health system, but leaves problems for the many important programmes that fall under this Office, including the marketing of South Africa internationally, and the status of women, the status of the disabled and the rights of the child. It is difficult to think of any person less suited to managing any of these tasks than Dr Tshabalala-Msimang.

Several old faces have also been retained for reasons that are extremely hard to find.

Trade and Industry Minister Mandisi Mpalwa continues to treat his portfolio as a retirement plan. In particular during the year he showed no interest at all in solving the problems affecting the National Lottery, despite a desperate situation facing many charities unable to obtain funding they were entitled to. A long delay in the completion of a review of the Motor Industry Development Programme continues to create great uncertainty in this industry, which holds many of South Africa's jobs and is particularly vulnerable in the current economic climate.

The score of Land and Agriculture Minister Lulu Xingwana has also fallen steadily over the past three years. This year, with the virtual disintegration of the Land Bank – an entity which should be helping poor, landless South Africans to create farming opportunities for themselves - her mismanagement became even more apparent than usual when the Bank was removed from her control and given to the Treasury. Evidence also emerged of a steep decline in South Africa's agricultural production – with severe consequences for our food security and a legacy of her neglect.

Foreign Affairs Minister Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma is another dismal performer, scoring 2. South Africa's performance in international forums continues to erode our commitment to promoting human rights, democracy and good governance principles. While the campaign to protect Zimbabwean President Robert Mugabe was spearheaded by former President Thabo Mbeki, Dlamini-Zuma showed no signs of differing with him.

Similarly, Communication Minister Ivy Matsepe-Casaburi's score fell yet again this year – to 1 – largely because of her bizarre (and unsuccessful) appeal against a court ruling which brought to an end years of messy ministerial interventions in communications which have kept our telephony costs among the highest in the world, and stifled jobs and investment in this sector.

Several average performers also held onto their jobs. Arts and Culture Minister Pallo Jordan, who scores 5, is central to developing a coherent idea among South Africans of how to define our national identity and interpret our past. Despite a (somewhat belated) firm response to corruption at the Robben Island Museum, many of the important institutions under his control continue to be badly mismanaged.

Overall, this year's Cabinet scores better than last year's, with a combined score in 2008 of 118 compared to 137 for this year. The higher score for this year reflects, however, an optimism that those new Ministers who have proved themselves capable in other fields, and who have started off well in their new jobs, will be able to sustain their performance over the next few months and, indeed, will be able to retain

their positions after next year's election. While there are several high scores, these scores remain very much provisional, and it is a Cabinet which one must evaluate with a high degree of caution. The next few months will give us far more clarity on what South Africans can expect from their new government.

## **THE PRESIDENT**

### **Kgalema Motlanthe - 8**

Having held office for less than three months, it remains to be seen whether Motlanthe will follow through with the promises he made early on in his tenure. However, overall, the Motlanthe presidency has thus far been characterised by temperateness and reasonableness, for which he scores a successful eight.

One of President Kgalema Motlanthe's first actions after assuming office was to meet with the Leader of the Opposition, Helen Zille, and other party leaders. His willingness to do so, and to engage in a frank and constructive discussion with the Democratic Alliance on core issues affecting South Africans - including a public enquiry into the arms deal, the possibility of a "political solution" to Jacob Zuma's corruption charges, and the electoral system - is commendable.

Motlanthe's response to the issues raised by the DA was impressive. He was open to the possibility of an arms deal enquiry; on the Zuma issue, he maintained that all people are equal before the law; and he agreed that the pure proportional representation system for electing public representatives has its shortcomings. Most encouraging of all, he committed himself to the independence of the judiciary and the supremacy of the Constitution.

In his first speech to Parliament as President, Motlanthe assured the nation that his administration would not deviate from the ANC's existing macroeconomic policy. He subsequently affirmed his statement by reinstating Trevor Manuel as Finance Minister, and appointing experienced former Finance Portfolio Committee Chairperson Nhlanhla Nene to act as Manuel's Deputy.

Motlanthe's pragmatism in retaining Manuel and ensuring a continuation of economic policy, despite calls from the ANC's Alliance partners for a more leftist economic strategy, demonstrated sound judgment, which he similarly displayed in other Cabinet appointments. While he chose to retain some seasoned Cabinet members, his decision to replace the heads of the critical Health, Safety and Security and Justice and Constitutional Development portfolios signaled a welcome shift in government policy towards one in which HIV/AIDS and crime are acknowledged, rather than denied.

On foreign affairs, Motlanthe has demonstrated a welcome return to a human rights-based policy. At a SADC Summit in November, Motlanthe called for an immediate ceasefire in the DRC so that humanitarian aid could be given to thousands of displaced people.

Although Motlanthe initially appeared to be taking a soft approach to Zimbabwe by retaining Thabo Mbeki as mediator, he later indicated a shift towards a tougher stance. In late November, government announced that given the humanitarian crisis in Zimbabwe it would be withholding R300 million in agricultural aid pending an agreement being reached between Zanu-PF and the MDC. However, in light of Zimbabwe's recent cholera epidemic, which is threatening to spill over in South Africa, it is imperative that Motlanthe now make a more direct intervention to resolve the crisis in Zimbabwe.

## **DEPUTY PRESIDENT**

## **Baleka Mbete - 7**

For her willingness to learn, and her initiative in highlighting and tackling key issues affecting South Africa, Mbete scores a worthy provisional 7.

Shortly after being elected President, Kgalema Motlanthe chose Baleka Mbete to be his Deputy. Mbete's appointment was a welcome development for Parliament as an institution, insofar as it eliminated the conflict of interest that had existed when she simultaneously held the positions of Speaker of the National Assembly and chairperson of both the ANC and its political committee.

In her new role as Deputy President, Mbete is responsible for assisting the President in the execution of the functions of government. Although new to the job, Mbete has shown an admirable willingness to learn the procedures and protocols attached to her new functions. According to Mbete, she maintains good relations with her predecessor, Phumzile Mlambo-Ngcuka, and has met with her to discuss the work of the Deputy President.

Mbete's other chief responsibility is to liaise between the executive and Parliament as the leader of government business - a role that, as the former Speaker of Parliament, she appears to be ideally suited to.

Upon assuming office, Mbete committed herself to prioritising HIV/AIDS, government's anti-poverty strategy, and the electricity situation. With only two months having passed since her appointment, it remains too soon to assess accurately her contribution to addressing these issues; however her recognition of their importance is a commendable step in the right direction.

In the future, Mbete's implementation of government's anti-poverty strategy will be closely watched. The plan, which aims to eliminate poverty by expanding economic opportunities, is in line with the DA's own policies for an open, opportunity society. It proposes public private partnerships to alleviate poverty. In her unveiling of the strategy in late October, Mbete called on South Africans, including civil society and business, to get involved in empowering the poor and incorporating them into the economy. Such partnerships are vital to redressing inequality and it is imperative that Mbete uses her term of office to ensure the efficient execution of the plan.

Speaking at the launch of a regional office of the Public Protector in the Northern Cape on 30 October, Mbete also promised to take strict action against government officials found to be involved in corruption. Her stance is a welcome, strong response from government towards the current high levels of corruption in the public service. However, it is hoped that Mbete will take a stricter line in disciplining corrupt government officials than she did with parliamentarians implicated in the travelgate scandal while Speaker of Parliament.

## **MINISTER IN THE PRESIDENT'S OFFICE**

### **Manto Tshabalala-Msimang - 4**

President Motlanthe did well to replace Manto Tshabalala-Msimang with Barbara Hogan as Health Minister. His decision to retain Tshabalala-Msimang in his Cabinet – by redeploying her as Minister in the Presidency – was less commendable. However, in light of the fact that Tshabalala-Msimang has only had a short period of time to readjust herself to her new responsibilities, she scores a very lenient four.

Tshabalala-Msimang's track record makes it difficult to justify her redeployment. According to researchers from the Harvard School of Public Health, more than 330 000 South Africans died from HIV/AIDS-related illnesses between 2000 and 2005, when Tshabalala-Msimang was Health Minister, because a feasible and timely antiretroviral (ARV) treatment program was not implemented. An estimated 35 000 babies were born with HIV during that same period due to the lack of a mother-to-child transmission prophylaxis programme using Nevirapine.

Perhaps Tshabalala-Msimang's political survival can be explained by the fact that her husband, Mendi Msimang, is a former ANC treasurer, and knows a great deal about the financial dealings and misdealings of the ruling party.

At any rate, she is less likely to do serious harm in the Presidency.

The Minister in the Presidency is responsible for managing Government Communication and Information Systems (GCIS), serves on the Board of the International Marketing Council, and is in charge of the Media Development and Diversity Agency. As such, Tshabalala-Msimang will play a pivotal role in managing the marketing of the South African government.

Another key function of the Minister in the Presidency is to oversee the Office on the Status of Women, the Office on the Status of Disabled Persons, and the Office on the Rights of the Child. However, since taking over her new portfolio, Tshabalala-Msimang has given just two speeches. The first, which was aimed at the elderly, was used by Tshabalala-Msimang to endorse fresh fruit and vegetables as preventative treatment against illnesses. In her second speech, she called on SADC and the AU to implement a strict 50/50 gender ratio in all political decision-making without providing a clear rationale for doing so.

Given her seeming unsuitability for the public relations aspect of her new job, it will be interesting to see how Tshabalala-Msimang fares. Her history in Cabinet casts a long and gloomy shadow over her new role, and she hasn't exactly hit the ground running, which calls into question the necessity of having a Minister in the Presidency.

## **ARTS AND CULTURE**

### **Pallo Jordan – 5**

Arts and Culture is one of the less high profile ministries. But this should not lead to an underestimation of the difficulties of juggling many interests and maintaining the integrity of many of our cultural institutions. Minister Jordan had a mixed record during the year and he retains his 2007 score of 5.

The Minister must be given credit for his clear stand on some grave social problems. In May, writing in his personal capacity in ANC Today, and going against his party's line, Minister Jordan confronted Zimbabwean President Robert Mugabe for attempting to hang on to power through illegitimate and violent means. The minister should also be commended for his public denunciation of xenophobic attacks in June and for the social cohesion campaign, aimed at affirming South Africa as a home for all, that he instigated as a result.

In June, Minister Jordan initiated a national consultation process over name changes – a process the DA welcomes.

But there are many problems with the management of his department. Aside from receiving a qualified opinion for 2007/8 financial year from the Auditor-General, the Minister's report for his department was tabled more than a month after the due date. Furthermore, the National Library of South Africa, a symbol of South Africa's intellectual heritage, is in such a bad state of affairs that two board members recently resigned in protest against poor management. For 2006/7 the library received a disclaimer from the Auditor-General. Yet the Minister has been reluctant to take action. The Pan South African Language Board also received a disclaimer of opinion.

There has also not yet been any sign of long (three years)-awaited legislation on place names which would help to clarify situations such as these.

In July 2008 a forensic report commissioned by the National Arts Council made it clear that serious fraud was being perpetrated at the Robben Island Museum. The Minister took too long to respond to this and remove the perpetrators, and the report has still not been made public.

During the year it emerged that the South African Languages Bill – which first appeared in 2003 – was still held up, and we still have no clarity on what is to happen with it. He was also the only Minister to have not produced his department's annual report by the deadline – part of an unfortunate trend we have remarked on in previous years of a negligent approach to the management of the entities under his control.

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

### **Ivy Matsepe-Casaburi – 1**

South Africa's telecommunications industry is stagnant because of the Minister of Communications Ivy Matsepe-Casaburi's policy of 'managed liberalization'. In the face of sustained criticism of her management of this sector, she unsuccessfully applied in September to appeal Judge N Davis's decisive judgment in the Altech case arguing that the ruling undermines her policy of managed liberalization. For this and many other reasons she scores 1 for this year. Last year she scored 2 points.

The Altech ruling now brings years of messy ministerial interventions and reversals dating back to 2004 to an end by directing that value added network service licenses can build their own networks instead of leasing from others.

Even worse she announced her intention to table amendments to the Electronic Communications Act (ECA) to nullify the effects of the Altech ruling despite the fact that Parliament rewrote the ECA in 2005 to usher in full competition because managed liberalization has failed the telecoms industry in the country.

As Professor Alison Gillwald of the The Edge Institute said '...with the bottom three quintiles of South Africans paying close to 20% of their income on communication, against 5% in peer economies, consumers and businesses may well ask what drives the continue defence of the policy of managed liberalization....the agreed policy time spans for protected monopoly and duopoly services have long come and gone'.

The Minister also failed to meet her own performance targets for the year. Six months into the current financial year none of the 233 Dinaledi schools which were

supposed to have been connected by Sentech via a wireless network were connected. Her department is yet to equip the host stadiums for the 2010 Soccer World Cup with 100% ICT infrastructure coverage in fulfillment of ICT guarantees for the tournament.

Another indictment on her was her handling of digital migration. The set of top box specifications which she persuaded cabinet to agree to will make this decoder unnecessarily expensive to consumers even after the poor receive subsidies. While the Director-General of Communications insists it will make e-government possible, we are yet to be told how. Besides, South Africa needs more channels and choice, not e-government.

## **CORRECTIONAL SERVICES**

### **Ngconde Balfour – 1**

Ngconde Balfour has just goes from bad to worse since last year. He presides over a department that has had six successive qualified audit reports, and just when his National Commissioner, Vernie Pietersen, began improving things, Balfour had him transferred to the Department of Sport.

Minister Balfour treats opposition with contempt and the Portfolio Committee on Correctional Services with disdain. He has also allowed himself to become embroiled in the processes that governed the award of a service provider contract to BOSASA for DCS catering services.

The Department of Correctional Services faces a range of serious challenges that include:

- Prison overcrowding, which creates a breeding ground for prison gangs and poor rehabilitation success;
- An inability to retain key professionals within the prisons, with the staff turnover rate for psychologists and pharmacists being 80.6% and 88.5% respectively;
- Limited education and training opportunities for inmates;
- Poor provision of basic services to inmates in terms of the White Paper, for example, access to health care); and
- Non-delivery in the building of the new generation prisons, designed to increase prison capacity.

The above issues are just a few examples of the problems facing the Department of Correctional Services and that these issues have been problems for years without any real improvement.

The kindest suggestion we can make is that Minister Balfour consults the “*Situations Vacant*” columns of the newspapers. His departure from public life cannot happen quickly enough. Only then can we expect to see any sustainable improvement within the Department.

## **DEFENCE (new)**

### **Mr Charles Nqakula – provisional 3**

The prior record of the newly appointed Minister of Defence, Charles Nqakula, does not auger well for his new role in defence. His tenure in the Ministry of Safety and

Security for the period 2002 until September 2008 was far from being exemplary and plagued by accusations of non-accountability and poor delivery. Mr Nqakula's relations with the media and the public, as well as with opposition members of Parliament during his tenure in Safety and Security was frequently strained and awkward, with the Minister tending to launch personal attack on critics rather than address their legitimate concerns. He scores a provisional 3.

The new Minister faces serious challenges within his new Department, which were not effectively dealt with by the previous Minister, Mr Lekota. These issues include:

- An ineffective military discipline system;
- Insufficient training for personnel;
- Combat readiness concerns such as age, health and fitness status of soldiers;
- Unruly and poorly disciplined military unions;
- The issue of inadequate funding to properly equip, train and maintain equipment and personnel in a state of combat readiness;
- Poor senior military leadership;
- Political interference in acquisition of weaponry and equipment;
- Vacancies in critical occupations such as engineers, technicians and pilots;
- A declining military ethos of discipline, selfless service to country and loyalty to the Constitution; and
- Overemphasis on demographics in career pathing and appointments..

These are similar issues to those facing the South African Police Service (for example, issues of recruitment, appointment and promotion as well as conduct issues). Mr Nqakula's failure to act decisively on these matters as Minister of Safety and Security does not bode well for his ability to address these concerns in the South African National Defence Force or the Department of Defence.

## **EDUCATION**

### **Naledi Pandor – 7**

South Africa's education system remains in a crisis, and a number of reports released during the year showed this. But some brutal honesty from education minister Naledi Pandor, and a bevy of significant and courageous new plans to address this crisis, may have put South Africa on the path towards the salvation of our education system, and she therefore increases her score of 5 from last year to a tentative 7.

Last year the DA accused Education Minister Naledi Pandor of tough talk but little action. This was not the case this year, and the minister took some educational bulls by the horns with some programmes to address some tough problems that were conspicuously ducked by her predecessors – in particular teacher performance, learner discipline and the lack of accountability within the system as a whole.

In April, the Minister, after a long battle with trade unions, signed into law new salary scales which allow performance to be taken into consideration in salary adjustments. She followed this up in May with a promise of legislation for the establishment of an inspectorate to evaluate the performance of teachers, and shortly after that with the formal introduction of random drug tests in schools.

In addition, some practical measures to increase the number of properly trained teachers should also have long term benefits – in particular a new system for teacher training and a plan to reopen teacher colleges closed in the 1990s.

A plan to track learners along their careers in the schools system is intended to help to monitor trends and identify problems early and she has proposed support centres for unruly learners.

A proposal for a school pledge had the potential to open many wounds on the question of allegiance and patriotism. By and large, however, the minister handled the issue with tact.

Finally, she was also one of only two national departments to receive a completely clean audit report for 2008.

One area in particular remains unaddressed. Concerns about the new curriculum continue to mount and it is clearly in urgent need of review. If she can take some steps to reduce the worries on the part of teachers and education experts about ambiguity and lack of rigor in the curriculum, and if her reform plans are implemented boldly, she may do better next year. Pandor's new proposals could represent a transformation in the government's approach to education. We look forward to monitoring their progress.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL AFFAIRS AND TOURISM**

### **Marthinus van Schalkwyk – 6**

Minister van Schalkwyk, who notably did not resign in solidarity with the majority of his Cabinet colleagues when the President was re-called, had a satisfactory year. Significant achievements include the passing of five pieces of environmental legislation in Parliament and the approval by Cabinet of the Long Term Mitigation Scenarios for South Africa. However, the implementation of the National Framework for Sustainable Development, drafted more than two years ago, remains unachieved.

The Waste Act and the Integrated Coastal Management Act are ambitious laws that were passed this year, both of which, if implemented correctly will improve environmental governance. The stricter penalties for environmental offences, as included in the National Environmental Laws Amendment Act, are very welcome. The Minister's work in achieving a compromise under the NEMA Amendment Act with regard to the Minister of Minerals and Energy being required to authorise mines in the future under NEMA EIA regulations is a progressive step. It is however regrettable that the Minister did not use his influence to speak out against the provisional licence granted by the Minister of Minerals to mine in the sensitive Wild Coast area. His department in fact missed the deadline for comment on the matter by three months.

The vacancy rate of 44% for environmental assessors in provincial conservation departments is unacceptably high. While filling these vacancies is not the competence of this Minister, strategic growing of these scarce skills on a national level is something the Minister needs to engage more actively with.

The Marine Living Resources Fund received a clean bill of health from the Auditor-General for the first time in four years. This is a commendable achievement, but closer analysis reveals that the compliance and scientific research budgets are

almost half the size today that they were in the 2004/2005 financial year. The country's patrol vessels spent considerably less time at sea this year than in previous years. The Minister failed to deliver a social plan for abalone fishers affected by his decision to close down the fishery. A legal abalone fishery according to scientific research remains viable east of Hermanus yet the Minister has refused to acknowledge this fact.

Tourism figures continue to grow despite a slow down of the international economy. International marketing by SA Tourism has been impressive, although reduced in extent due to the fall in the value of the Rand. There remains a need for the Minister to work with StasSA to revise the measurements of what constitutes a tourist as the figures currently include same day visitors which serves to artificially inflate the arrivals figure.

## **FINANCE**

### **Trevor Manuel – 7**

During a tumultuous year of domestic political uncertainty and international financial meltdown, the Minister for Finance has been reasoned, confident and settled.

The investment community seems to look at him as the glue that holds the economy in place; the announcement of Manuel's resignation – later explained as part of the process leading to the formation of a new Cabinet – led the rand to fall by 2.5 per cent and the JSE top 40 index to drop by almost 4 per cent.

Since Polokwane, COSATU and the SACP have been crowing for a more interventionist developmental state. Unlike others in his party Manuel has taken on his responsibility of leadership. In chastening these calls he has argued that any significant shift to the left under the auspices of a false and unsustainable hope will be an abuse of the people of this country.

He has also supported the Democratic Alliance's ideals for an open opportunity society by publicly recognising that a patronage serving culture of delivery and empowerment constitute significant threats to the value systems of South Africa.

He has continued to follow a prudent macroeconomic path and while South Africa has felt the effects of the world financial crisis, there is no doubt that the effects would have been far more devastating without these policies.

The Finance Minister's next challenge is being able to provide more employment tax incentives without drastically reducing the tax pool. Obviously it is easier to collect tax from registered and regulated companies than it is from individuals. The current model of encouraging consumption through the income tax breaks of individuals, whilst politically popular, is going to be countered by the credit tightening of the post financial crisis world in 2009. These pressures will also act to reduce tax revenues which will place additional pressure on the State's ability to provide for its extensive social welfare net.

As the Mbeki era has shown, as hard as he may try, Trevor Manuel will never be able to transform this society single-handedly. Given the failures of many of his fellow cabinet ministers, if South Africa is to shift towards a high employment, low poverty economy, emphasis and incentives should be directed towards the private sector so that it can achieve that which his colleagues have failed to do.

## **FOREIGN AFFAIRS**

### **Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma – 2**

Minister Nkosazana Dlamini-Zuma's scores 2 for this year. She is virtually absent from public life and diplomats complain about her serial unavailability. Serious questions arise as to whether she has any interest in the role that she plays.

2008 was generally an embarrassing year for South Africa in international affairs. Instead of using the country's second term on the United Nations Security Council to restore the country's dented image due to a series of controversial votes, South Africa still flirted with human rights abusers and temporized with tyranny.

The country's performance in international forums continues to erode South Africa's commitment to promoting human rights, democracy and good governance principles. South Africa sided with rogue states in international forums to undermine democratic values. We also shielded dictators from international scrutiny.

South Africa consistently frustrated every UN Security Council initiative to put Zimbabwe under international scrutiny, including a UN Security Council vote aimed at allowing international observers to observe the Zimbabwe's presidential and parliamentary elections. Pretoria also endorsed Mugabe's one-man election run-off victory despite strong evidence pointing to a rigged poll. In June SA blocked UN sanctions against Zimbabwe to promote Robert Mugabe's illegitimate regime.

While the campaign to protect Mugabe was spearheaded by Mbeki, Dlamini-Zuma supported him throughout instead of advising the former president to take a tough stance against Robert Mugabe since quiet diplomacy was failing to break the political impasse between the ZANU-PF and the MDC.

South Africa also opposed the decision of the prosecutor of the International Criminal Court to pursue charges of crimes against humanity against Sudanese President Omar Al-Bashir, and supported the nomination of human rights abuser Jean Ziegler for the position of advisor to the UN Human Right Council. In all these instances the department hid behind obscure technicalities to justify its morally flawed decisions.

The department is facing serious capacity constraints at its missions abroad. Despite filling more than 400 diplomatic posts during the year, there are still more than 525 vacant posts across all South Africans missions in the world.

The department obtained a clean audit report to consolidate its stable financial performance.

## **HEALTH (new)**

### **Barbara Hogan – provisional 8**

Minister Hogan did not have to meet high standards to improve on the record of her predecessor, who traditionally received a score of 0 in the DA's cabinet report card. But within hours of taking over this portfolio, Minister Hogan had swept away the low expectations associated with it, dusted off the cobwebs of Aids dissidence and completely reconfigured the atmosphere. But we have yet to see the real detail of her transformation plans. She scores a provisional 8.

Minister Hogan is principled and hard working, and has acquired an irreproachable reputation during her years as an anti-apartheid activist and her tenure in Parliament. Her performance in the Portfolio Committee on Finance, of which she was the Chairperson, was often brilliant and never belied the fact that she was solidly in touch with her constituency.

She now has a much bigger job with, in particular, three enormous challenges – stopping the medical brain drain, improving hospital conditions and stopping the spread of HIV/Aids.

The first was almost completely ignored by the former minister and if anything, her Aids denialism and her antagonism worsened the situation. Minister Hogan will need to make it clear to doctors and nurses that they are needed and wanted in the public sector and put in place some mechanisms to make it easier for them to stay. While she has commented on this problem, we have yet to any clear proposals in this regard.

The second revolves principally around the desperately poor quality of service in many public hospitals. This is due partly to vacancies, but also to the quality of hospital management and the hospital management model which applies. Minister Hogan has committed herself to turning the situation around in five years and has said to “expect real change”. She also began well by releasing a report into the diabolical conditions in several Eastern Cape hospitals which led to 140 babies dying earlier this year. But she has not yet described exactly how she is going to do so.

The third involves getting the half-hearted Aids treatment programme and almost non-existent prevention programme properly on track. Minister Hogan has identified Aids and TB as South Africa’s biggest challenges. Again, however, no plans have yet been laid out.

While her start has been encouraging, the real proof will be in the coming months as she begins to devise and implement plans to confront the health system’s problems.

## **HOME AFFAIRS**

### **Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula - 1**

Home Affairs Minister Mrs. Nosiviwe Mapisa-Nqakula’s score drops to on, from two last year. There are still no significant improvements to the overall performance of her department despite the introduction of the much-vaunted turnaround strategy. To quote the chairperson of the portfolio committee ‘we have heard about the turnaround strategy but we have not seen any action’.

The department obtained another disclaimer from the Auditor-General for the 2007/08 financial year; its books were in such a bad state that the Auditor-General could not comment on them.

In June the portfolio committee discovered that the costs of the ‘Who am I on line’ project had increased from R1 billion to R4 billion within a year without any proper feedback about the status of the project. When the committee approached the Minister about the escalating costs of the project, she indicated that she had already instructed the Auditor-General to investigate the matter. However, the Auditor-General’s office revealed in October that the department was refusing to supply his office with some of the information it had requested for the investigation.

The biggest indictment on the inept leadership of the Minister of Home Affairs came to light during the outbreak of the xenophobic violence in May. Although nearly 50 people died, she downplayed the scale of the xenophobic attacks when they first emerged and her department dragged its feet in providing victims of xenophobia at the safety camps with temporary papers that would help them access humanitarian assistance.

It seems Mapisa-Nqakula has never had a coherent plan to resolve the chaos that surrounds the regulations of refugee. Early in the year, for example, the department instructed its offices not to renew section 22 permits (a renewable document that acknowledges that foreign nationals are in the country legally but does not qualify them for refugee status) to asylum seekers. In October the Cape High Court found that the department's actions were unlawful and ordered it to renew those permits.

The department also still has an unacceptable rate of backlogs and vacancies. There was a backlog of 89 584 asylum applications and 43 129 passports at the end of May this year. A total of more than 1 800 generic posts and 656 posts for help desk staff were vacant in the nine provincial offices.

The Minister summed up a dismal year by rejecting the portfolio committee's suggestion to bring in the Treasury and the Department of Public Service and Administration to help the department manage its resources better.

## **HOUSING**

### **Lindiwe Sisulu – 4**

Various problems emerged during the year with Minister of Housing Lindiwe Sisulu's implementation of some specific housing programmes. These were mainly indicative of the absolute failure of the Minister's overall strategic direction. Because she has continued to persist blindly with an approach that is neither workable nor affordable, the DA downgrades Minister Sisulu's score of 5 from last year to 4.

The Minister has set herself the objective of eradicating informal settlements by 2014. More than 400 000 affordable houses would need to be built every year to do so. Yet less than half of this is being delivered, while the backlog growing all the time.

It is clear that a policy involving the top-down delivery of formal houses to all cannot work in these circumstances. A more flexible approach, making more use of individual initiative, would achieve more at a lower cost. Yet the minister has continued with the numbers-over-quality approach, and there were some disastrous manifestations of this during the year.

In April the Western Cape provincial treasury announced that it was withholding R300 million meant for the N2 Gateway Housing Project until the problems engulfing it were resolved – including the forced relocation of 4000 households to make way for Gateway homes. These evictions resulted in a subsequent successful Constitutional Court challenge by these households.

Thubelisha Homes, a section 21 company that undertakes low-cost housing projects for the national Department, presented a dismal performance review to Parliament in May, revealing that not a single target had been achieved, while it had made a loss of R67 million.

In September, concerns about the quality of many homes built were raised again with figures showed that more than 40 000 government-subsidised homes were in need of renovation.

In pursuance of her overall policy direction, Minister Sisulu announced during the year that she intended to act to prohibit people from erecting shacks and instead move them to “transit camps”. Yet in May she stated that about 1.2 million people moved from rural areas into urban centres every year. It is not clear how she intends to prohibit these migrants from erecting shacks while also providing them with “transit” accommodation – a scheme for which there does not yet seem to be a plan.

Minister Sisulu continued to hold onto her post after the September Cabinet reshuffle. But a change might have boosted South Africa’s housing delivery programme.

## **INTELLIGENCE (new)**

### **Siyabonga Cwele – provisional 6**

The Hon. Siyabonga Cwele was appointed Minister for Intelligence on 25 September 2008 during the Cabinet reshuffle following the election of President Motlanthe by Parliament. His previous solid record on intelligence matters gives him a provisional score of 6.

As a Member of Parliament and, since 2004 the Chairperson, of the Joint Standing Committee on Intelligence (JSCI), he over the years gained enormous experience of and insight into the workings of the Intelligence Community of South Africa. He has a good understanding of the way this Community functions and has proven himself committed to the principles of the proper and very necessary oversight over all Intelligence structures, ensuring a balance between the typical secretive functioning of the Community and the transparency needed in our Democracy over such structures.

As Chairperson, Cwele has shown himself to be an objective overseer of the various Intelligence structures he now is the political Head of and with his experience is possibly the best appointment in this Portfolio since its inception in our new democracy. He has proved himself able to deal with a number of problems and intelligence scandals the JSCI had to deal with over the past years, and were instrumental in ensuring that Reports on these problems were tabled in Parliament for public scrutiny.

We are of the opinion that he probably will be able to take what was constructive and good from Kasrils’ term and build on it to ensure an accountable Intelligence Community, as well as continue the acceptable relationship between the Ministry and Parliament to further the transparency of these structures.

We trust that he will take from the Report and work of the Ministerial Review Commission that which will advance the needed and proper regulatory and legislative framework for this Community to ensure compliance with our democratic principles and limit abuse of powers and secrecy as far as possible. We shall monitor his ability to scrutinize the three Intelligence Bills just withdrawn by the *ad hoc* Committee on Intelligence, take note of all the public concerns, and deal with their re-introduction to Parliament. The regulating of the NCC remains a much-needed priority.

Minister Cwele may well prove to be the ideal and suitable candidate to retain this position in the Cabinet after the 2009 Elections. However, only time will tell if he will

be able to rise above the politics of serving in the Cabinet, as he was able to do as Chairperson of the JSCI.

## **JUSTICE AND CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT (new)**

### **Enver Surty – provisional 7**

Based on her performance, we can safely rate the former Minister a “G” for “Go!” Given the critical importance of this department, it is imperative that we have the right person as minister, and the replacement of Brigitte Mabandla with Enver Surty as Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development (DoJCD) is a welcome step. Based on his previous record, and his interventions so far, we give him a tentative 7.

Minister Surty is one of the few members of Cabinet to have real expertise in his portfolio, having practiced as a general and human rights lawyer for almost two decades.

While Minister Surty does have legal and senior government experience (he served as deputy minister of education for several years), however, he still has to prove himself in his new post. But his response so far to the multitude of serious problems that his department faces augers well. He has taken a strong stand on judicial independence, stating that “our democracy depends largely on the independence of our courts”, and has emphasised the need for trust and mutual respect between the various components of the justice system. He has also committed himself to resolving some of the core management problems that bog down the justice system.

When Deputy Minister Johnny de Lange announced the government’s review of the criminal justice system in August this year he admitted that the criminal justice system had become dysfunctional; a serious indictment of the previous Minister. Minister Surty is inheriting a department plagued by lack of capacity and poor service delivery as well as allegations of political interference. We look forward to seeing what he is able to do to turn this performance around.

## **LABOUR**

### **Membathisi Mdladlana – 2**

This year the minister drops a point from last year’s score of 3 points. This is largely due to the fact that for the past four consecutive financial years the various institutions he controls have performed dismally.

The National Skills Fund (NSF) received a qualified opinion in 2008. The Auditor-General could not obtain appropriate evidence to confirm the existence, valuation and completeness of commitments to the value of R1.5 billion. This figure was R 745 million in 2007. The Fund also did not comply with applicable legislation, such as the PFMA and the Skills Development Levies Act.

The NSF plays a critical role in employment creation in South Africa. It deals with skills programmes, learnerships, apprenticeships, and internships. 75% of the unemployed are the youth between 15 and 34 years old. It is indeed an indictment on the minister that the NSF, a body with such a vital mandate, is not properly managed.

The Sheltered Employment Factories Programme was indicted by the A-G for fraudulent cheques cashed by unknown parties amounting to R570 209.

Productivity SA - which has a pivotal role to play in the development and enhancement of productivity and competitiveness in workplaces throughout South Africa and within the country's crucial SMME sector - is technically insolvent. The consequences of this development for the South African working economy could prove dire – particularly in the context of the current economic slowdown, in which a growing number of local industries are in distress and in need of rehabilitation.

The Compensation Fund is also in trouble. The Fund does not comply with the Public Finance Management Act or the Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act. Further misbehaviour, including materially incorrect assessments, lack of appropriate record keeping and filing system, lack of sufficient documentation and a breakdown of internal controls, compelled the Auditor-General to give the Fund, once again, a disclaimer of opinion. Although the Fund has an annual income of R4 billion and has reserves of R18 billion in its bank account, it is riddled with administrative bungling and poor management. There are thousands of outstanding payments to beneficiaries, some dating back to 1993.

There was also no improvement in the Media Advertising, Printing and Packaging Seta which again received a qualified opinion for this current year, as well as the Energy Seta.

The Construction Seta is plagued by continuing problems. While the construction industry recommended that the minister put the Ceta under administration, the minister has done nothing so far.

The minister needs to urgently address many problems with compliance with labour laws by industry. As recently as November 2008 for example 2 workers died and 15 were injured as a result of the collapse of the office block in Little Flats in Roodeport due to non-compliance with building safety regulations.

Earlier in the year the Minister uttered very divisive public statements when commenting on the court ruling that included the Chinese people as black economic beneficiaries.

The minister criticised the judgement in a manner that showed that he still views South Africa through fundamentally racist lenses when as a leader he should be creating an environment where non-racialism triumphs.

Lastly, while the minister has to account to the portfolio committee, he has not once during the last year attended a portfolio committee meeting to account for the sorry state of affairs in his department. He gets a well deserved 2 out of 10.

## **LAND AND AGRICULTURE**

### **Lulu Xingwana – 2**

Although the Department of Agriculture received a clean audit from the Auditor-General this year, the minister's performance at the Land Affairs Department was not impressive overall. Her score changes from last year's 3 out 10 to 2 out of 10.

Her Department under-spent by over 141 million for the 2007/8 financial year. This is a high figure considering the steady fall in agricultural production in South Africa in recent years and continuing problems in getting small-scale agriculture going successfully

Enormous uncertainty of title was created during the year by the Expropriation Bill. While it was not her bill, she did nothing to involve herself in resolving the problems that emerged from this highly contentious proposal and seemed happy to allow it to proceed.

The DA is gravely concerned by reports from the National Agricultural Marketing Council (NAMC) that a decline in national crop production is threatening South Africa's household food security. During the year figures showed that South Africa had moved from being exporters of food to food importers – an indication of the falling number of commercial farms in South Africa and part of Minister Xingwana's legacy.

The NAMC says that field crop production has declined by 19% since 1991 and at the same time the population which needs to be fed has grown by 32%. This figure rises when the impact of large-scale immigration into South Africa is considered.

Her meddling in the affairs of the Land Bank resulted in the bank's removal from her leadership and being moved to the Treasury; the ultimate vote of no confidence in her leadership. The reports that the Land Bank suffered a loss totaling R41 million under her stewardship were alarming. Payments totalling R80 million are alleged to have been paid to non-existing companies. These patently fraudulent transactions had earlier prompted the resignation of the board's head of audit, Joe Mthimunye, and Modise Motlaba, head of risk management.

She has also been unable to manage the provision of support to beneficiaries of land reform. This has not only hurt the intended beneficiaries, but examples abound of productive land going to ruin.

Finally, the Department has failed to deliver on many of its targets or make itself financially accountable. In the case of restitution applications, 165 rural claims out of a total of 3 485 had been settled, with 283 991 hectares of land being distributed for land reform out of a total target of 647 125 hectares. The promised audit of state assets has still not materialised. Every report her department has received since she took it over has been qualified.

## **MINERALS AND ENERGY**

### **Buyelwa Sonjica – 4**

Minister of Minerals and Energy Buyela Sonjica barely comments on policy matters in her portfolio. Yet in the rare instances she does so, she never misses the opportunity to be caught in controversy. She seems more willing to hurl insults at opposition leaders or use racist slurs against those who disagree with her than confront the challenges in her department. She scores 4 for her performance.

She will be best remembered for urging South Africans 'go to sleep earlier so that you can grow and be cleverer' during the energy crisis instead of proposing sound policies to deal with the power outages. She was completely invisible during the energy crisis – leaving the former Minister of Public Enterprises Alex Erwin to do damage control in respect of issues relating to energy policy and crisis management, both of which fall squarely within her line of responsibility.

She is still dragging her feet in prioritizing mining safety. Despite her visits to various mines at which workers died while on duty and the portfolio committee passing

amendments to the Mine Health and Safety Act earlier this year, mine deaths are still high due to poor compliance with mining safety and health regulations. This year 156 mineworkers have died on duty so far, often due to poor mining health and safety compliance.

The DME's mining and safety inspectorate is confronted by capacity constraints that prevent it from ensuring that all mines adhere to mining safety and health regulations. Very little has been done to ensure that the directorate is fully capacitated to deal with the challenges of mining safety. She is yet to release the presidential mining safety audit which will give a clear indication of the scale of mining safety in the country to the public.

It is furthermore clear that she is unable to motivate her department to effectively deal with the licensing process of applications for mineral rights under the Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act. Statistics from the department show that only one license was granted out of the 470 applications that were received in the first quarter of the year. The department's inability to process applications on a speedy and fair basis discourages foreign direct investment in the mining sector.

## **PROVINCIAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT (new)**

### **Shiceka Sicelo – provisional 5**

The former Minister of Provincial and Local Government Sydney Mufamadi was clearly out of touch with the problems in local government and many of the problems that we raised in last year's report have simply repeated themselves this year. While it is still early days to judge the performance of the new Minister, Shiceka Sicelo, he scores a provisional 5 for a tentative first two months in office.

There is no doubt he faces many problems. Municipal finances are in shambles largely due to the non-payment of municipal service fees and financial mismanagement. Municipal debts rocketed to R79 billion for the year under review – increasing by R51 billion from 2007.

The impact of Project Consolidate on improving the financial performance of municipalities is still hard to see. Many of the municipalities that were given assistance from experts, as part of Project Consolidate, to manage their resources better are still plagued by corruption, organizational leadership challenges and service delivery shortfalls.

Most local councils are incapacitated by skills shortages. An estimated 30% of the country's councillors who are illiterate have indicated that they are unable to perform their duties with the required distinction. A total 36 chief financial officer (CFO) posts were vacant in local municipalities throughout the country for the 2007/08 financial year. Some of these posts have been vacant for as long as four years.

The new minister will have to pay special attention to improving the financial performance of municipalities and deciding whether to continue allocating state grants to the South African Local Government Association (SALGA) when the organization is failing to manage its finances wisely.

He has launched his tenure on a positive note by meeting with the communities of Khutsong, Moutshe and Matatiele to consult them over their disputes with the department for incorporation into Gauteng, Limpopo and the Eastern Cape respectively. He has also moved quickly to demonstrate his intolerance for corruption

by facilitating the suspension of the secretary of the National Council of Provinces, pending an investigation into allegations of nepotism. But it was unwise and populist to blame the opposition for the Khutsong problem, especially as he was part of the NCOP committee that approved the shift.

His experience as a former MEC for Development Planning and Local Government in Gauteng and the chairperson of the selective committee on local government in the NCOP will likely come in handy for him in his last few months in office.

## **PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**

### **Brigitte Mabandla – provisional 4**

In the 2006/2007 financial year, the Department of Public Enterprises spent almost 24 per cent of its current payments budget on consultants, contractors and special services.

One can only hope that the new Minister, Bridget Mabandla, has spent some of that vast funding on a relationship management guru, given that in her new role she is expected to oversee the massive R400 billion infrastructure programme and we simply cannot afford for her to have yet more “irretrievable” relationships breakdowns with the management of Transnet and Eskom.

Although Eskom’s failures are not directly attributable to the new Minister (the same can not be said of her predecessor), the threat that an irregular power supply has on the growth potential of the economy, especially in labour intensive industries like mining and construction, means that the Minister must communicate Eskom’s investment strategy in order that industry and the broader public can plan for their future electricity needs. So far she has failed to do so.

Transnet has an equally vital role in promoting growth and also food security. The seasonality of agriculture have made soft commodity producers unfavoured clients of Transnet because their freight needs are not consistent throughout the year. This status has forced many co-operatives to turn to road freight, which significantly raises transport costs and the price of food to the end user.

Some commentators have speculated that the new Minister is killing time until her starkly un-illuminating cabinet career ends after next year’s elections. Given the importance of the assets that fall under her new portfolio one can only hope that she will make some final effort to finish her career at a more productive pace than the almost static approach she has followed up till now.

## **PUBLIC SERVICE AND ADMINISTRATION (new)**

### **Richard Baloyi – provisional 5**

Public Service and Administration Committee Chairperson Richard Baloyi took over as Public Service and Administration Minister in October 2008 after the resignation of Geraldine Frasier-Moleketi. His performance over the last two months has been run of the mill to say the least, and certain choices made by him do not bode well for his future period in office.

One of these choices was giving in to Minister of Correctional Services Ngconde Balfour’s demand to redeploy Correctional Services Commissioner Vernie Peterson.

Petersen had been taking a strong stance against corruption in Correctional Services.

Minister Baloyi brokered a deal to swop Vernie Petersen with Sport and Recreation Director-General (DG) Xoliswa Sibeko. He defended his decision by arguing that it was done 'in the interests of the country'. But it is clear that he allowed himself to become a pawn for Minister Balfour's own personal interests.

Secondly, despite the fact that Baloyi, while Chairperson of the Public Service and Administration Portfolio Committee, endorsed the committee's decision to withdraw the Public Administration Management Bill (which will create a Single Public Service), he has since stated that this bill will be reintroduced into Parliament in 2009.

It is clear that this bill has Constitutional implications as it infringes on the separation of powers of the three spheres of government, and it is therefore cause for concern that Minister Baloyi endorses this bill in its current form.

However, we welcome the fact that Minister Baloyi has shown interest in trying to deal with the many problems facing the State Information Agency (SITA). The former minister failed miserably in solving these problems that culminated in the resignation of CEO Llewellyn Jones in July in the midst of accusations of tender irregularities.

Minister Baloyi does not have a great deal of experience at national government level. Baloyi, who is also the ANC Treasurer-General, worked in the ANC provincial leadership before being elected as an MP only in 1999 where he became a member and then eventually Chairperson of the Portfolio Committee of Public Service and Administration. He has been accused by some of being too lenient at times on former Minister Fraser-Moleketi and her department when it came to exercising his oversight function as a portfolio committee chairperson.

Both his inexperience and sacrificing his oversight responsibilities when it got in the way of his party's political interests do not place him in good stead to deal with the many problems facing the Public Service and it will be interesting to see whether these negative attributes affect his performance as Minister of Public Service and Administration. Unfortunately, his redeployment of Vernie Petersen hints to the fact that they will have an affect.

## **PUBLIC WORKS (new)**

### **Geoff Doidge – provisional 8**

Minister Geoff Doidge's stint as Public Works Minister has been a short one so far. However, he has made a number of decisions in this short time that have revealed his potential for becoming a Minister who both values the key tenets of democracy and manages his responsibilities well.

Most probably the best way that this has been demonstrated is Minister Doidge's withdrawal of the controversial Built Environment Professions Bill at the eleventh hour after it had already been pushed through by the ANC majority in the National Assembly.

The Built Environment Professions Bill, if it had been passed, would have given the Minister of Public Works - who is not an engineer - wide arbitrary powers. The bill would create a "super council", in the form of a South African Council for the Built Environment, which would relegate the existing engineering bodies to mere

professional boards. This would have flouted international best practice, wherein professional bodies are self-regulating.

Minister Doidge has called for more consultation and has appointed a special advisor to his ministry to advise him on the contents of the bill.

The Minister adopted a similar approach to the even more contentious Expropriation Bill, which was withdrawn from Parliament towards the end of 2008. Doidge recently affirmed that work on the Bill would continue but that he would be studying legal opinions and following a proper consultation process.

One of the main objectives of the Department of Public Works is the National Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP). Minister Doidge recently announced that more than R4 billion had been made available for the EPWP2 programme and that a target of four million work opportunities in five years had been set.

While this seems impressive, it is going to be interesting to see how he tackles the challenge of making the EPWP2 into a project that creates more permanent work opportunities and more usable skills.

It is evident that Minister Doidge will face a number of challenges in the upcoming months. However, he has excelled in many of the previous high positions he was appointed to, including deputy chief whip of the ANC, ANC whip of programming, debates and house cluster, convener of the task team on the remuneration of public office bearers (Moseneke Task Team) and lastly as a House Chairperson of the National Assembly. It was especially in this last position that Minister Doidge demonstrated his impartiality and fairness when filling in for presiding officers during sittings of the NA and his constant professionalism and dedication. All these characteristics put him in good stead to transform the Public Works Department.

## **SAFETY AND SECURITY (new)**

### **Nathi Mthethwa – provisional 6**

The previous Minister of Safety and Security, Charles Nqakula, stepped down in September and Nathi Mthethwa, previously the ANC's Chief Whip in the National Assembly, replaced him.

Given the fact that crime preoccupies South Africans more than anything else, and that crime has an immense impact on perceptions, investment, confidence and development, this job is one of the most important in the country. It is critical that the person appointed to this role take some quick and decisive steps to address the many weaknesses in the policing system, and indeed Minister Mthethwa has brought more energy and resolve to this portfolio and some welcome proposals for reform. Nevertheless, Minister Mthethwa previously acquired a poor reputation at Parliament for his lack of organisational and management skills and he will need to shake this off to do a good job in his new position. The DA gives him a tentative 6.

Minister Mthethwa's public pronouncements so far have been refreshing in their honesty about the problems facing the war on crime, and he has honed in very directly on some of the biggest shortcomings of the police; the lack of specialised units to tackle specific crime problems, the lack of adequate crime intelligence gathering and poor relationships between the SAPS and communities, business and

the private security industry. If he is able to deal only with these three problems, he will have justified his appointment.

Minister Mthethwa has made strong declarations about making criminals “reap what they sow”. But he has so far done so without crossing the line into calls amounting to throwing out the Constitution, in the way that other ministers have. We look forward to seeing how his hard-hitting talk translates into policy. Minister Mthethwa did oversee the legislation that saw the final demise of the Scorpions, with no apparent concerns about this outrageously political action, and in fact helped to justify its demise with a claim that it had not done its job properly. There is probably little he could have done to stop this process, given the momentum behind it, but he will need to make sure that the new entity that replaces it does in fact have real teeth.

His declaration that he will replace disgraced Police Commissioner Jackie Selebi with a permanent commissioner is also very welcome, but awaits action.

Minister Mthethwa has no experience in the complex new world that he has taken on. He has, however, made a promising start.

## **SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY**

### **Mosibudi Mangena – 8**

Science and technology minister and Azapo President, Mosibudi Mangena, lacks the strong public profile of many other members of Cabinet. But he has the kind of unaffected, co-operative approach to his job that would allow many of his more high-flying colleagues to be more successful and he has impressed the scientific community with his integrity and interest in his portfolio. His 2007 score of 7 increases to 8.

The role of the department of science and technology is to harness the expertise that exists in South Africa creatively. In this facilitating role Mr Mangena seems to be comfortable and capable. His decisions about where to focus his department's energies appear to be sound and under his management his department operates smoothly. Spending on research and development by all sectors in South Africa is growing faster than our GDP, and a tax credit introduced in 2006 is predicted to catapult investment in R&D beyond the target of 1% of GDP this financial year.

Minister Mangena took one unusual plunge into controversy in August when he warned South Africans to “learn the bitter lessons of our brothers and sisters beyond our northern border” and not allow democracy in South Africa to be eroded. He must be praised for taking this stand, which contrasts strongly with the rest of the Cabinet's acquiescence.

Other than this, however, he has doggedly and without clamor implemented a range of potentially significant new programmes.

South Africa and Australia are the two countries remaining in the competition to be the site for the construction of the Square Kilometre Array, which will be a telescope 50 times more powerful than any yet built and will bring a massive investment of funds into the winning country. The announcement is expected later this year.

As part of his plans to help South Africa win this prize, the Astronomy Geographic Advantage Act came into effect in June. Two new research centres were also

opened - the AIMS Research Centre, offering post-graduate training in the mathematical sciences, and the NITheP, a user facility for theoretical physics – which are also intended to boost our chances of winning the Square Kilometer Array prize.

In June Minister Mangena launched a programme for unemployed science graduates, thus tackling an often-expressed concern that South Africans with skills are often not able to put their skills to productive use.

An important aspect of the Minister's activities during the year involved measures to enhance and increase the exploitation of indigenous knowledge. Plans were announced, for example, to create a public funding agency to bridge the innovation gap between the local knowledge base and the productive economy.

## **SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT**

### **Zola Skweyiya – 6**

Social development minister Zola Skweyiya started the year off well with the announcement that more than 6000 people have been convicted of social grant fraud and 16 188 fraudsters have agreed to pay back R89 million. His department is, moreover, mostly well run and Dr Skweyiya has been open about the problems his department faces. For all of these reasons his score improves one point this year to six.

But it was not all such good news for the minister this year, ensuring that his score did not improve any more.

Fraud remains one of the biggest shadows over Dr Skweyiya's record, and the minister himself admitted in March that the new SA Social Security Agency, created two years ago to stop fraud, had failed to put an end to social grants fraud. The Minister blames national intelligence for inadequate vetting and failure to weed out syndicates. But he must take ultimate responsibility for this failure and the good work of the Special Investigating Unit he set up in 2005 to combat this only partly compensates for this. A particular problem is that almost 50% of the posts in the unit tasked with detecting fraud are vacant.

Another problem which plagued him during the year was the revelation that his department had lost a massive R9bn (and stood to lose another R4.5bn) because of its lethargy in replacing a defective system for smart cards for pensions. The department initially awarded the tender to former ANC exile Obbey Mabena, But the Minister of Finance objected on the grounds of various inadequacies. The matter has still not been resolved, despite a letter from former President Mbeki to Skweyiya in 2006 instructing him and the Minister of Finance to compile a joint report on ways in which the Socpen problem could be resolved.

A plan for a national contributory scheme for pensions have been considerably delayed. However, given the significant implications, it is certainly preferable that the scheme be thoroughly debated rather than rushed through.

A dire shortage of social workers remains another major problem for the minister, and while South Africa needs at least another 16 000 social workers, he has not informed us of any immediate plans to find them and procedures for employing social workers (especially those with foreign qualifications) remains strangled by red tape.

## **SPORT AND RECREATION**

### **Makhenkhesi Stofile – 3**

Minister of Sport Makhenkhesi Stofile scores 3 points for this year – three points down from last year's score. 2008 was a bad year for South African sport and Rev. Stofile had a terrible year at the helm of the department despite the fact that preparations for the 2010 FIFA Soccer World Cup are mostly on track.

Team South Africa pulled off its worst performance since the country's readmission to international sport at the 2008 Beijing Olympics Games - winning only one bronze medal. The department's multimillion expo at the Olympic Games was a big flop; it opened a week later than scheduled and closed a week earlier. The national soccer team plummeted to 85<sup>th</sup> in world rankings. The only bright spot for SA sport was the Paralympics team which won 36 medals in Beijing.

The department continues to neglect school sports. The Schools Aquatics Championships which were supposed to take place in February had to be postponed at the last minute because the department declined to pay for the transport and accommodation expenses of swimmers as it had in previous years.

While the Minister has previously demonstrated courageous leadership during difficult times in SA sport, Rev. Stofile abandoned all neutrality in a debate about the future of the Springbok emblem. The most absurd of his claims was that the South African Rugby Union (SARU) had used the emblem 'illegally' when in fact it later emerged that the SARU was the rightful owner of the emblem. At a time where his leadership was desperately needed, he perpetuated division. His delayed intervention to allow SARU to use the Springboks emblem alongside the King Protea should have been made early to avoid the unnecessary acrimonious debate between rugby officials and some sports leaders in the country.

Things were also terrible institutionally. The department obtained a qualified audit opinion from the Auditor-General for the second successive year. One of the Auditor-General's major findings was that grants to provinces for the mass participation games were not accounted for. There is no doubt that 2008 will go down in the record books as the worst year for Rev. Makhenkhesi Stofile as the Minister of Sport.

## **TRADE AND INDUSTRY**

### **Mandisi Mpahlwa – 3**

The Minister of Trade and Industry, Mandisi Mpahlwa, has been one of the Cabinet's consistent underperformers, and he continued to give the impression during 2008 of being barely awake. In the absence of any real sign of new life or energy from him, his score drops to 2.

Minister Mpahlwa briefly emerged from the shadows in November to proclaim that he was considering removing skills development from the empowerment scorecard – a highly problematic proposal which had to be contradicted by his department the next day.

Other than that, he has stayed well in the background. The National Lottery was much in the news during the year for a catatonic grant payout rate and complaints about unanswered phones, lost documents, and inertia, leaving many charities facing closure. The Minister, who is responsible for appointing the National Lotteries Board, had nothing to say about the problems.

There were various other problems that Minister Mpahlwa seemed to be unaware of. Small and medium enterprises are the engines of economic growth, yet South Africa continues to do virtually nothing to smooth the path for people with initiative and ideas to open businesses. A long delay in the completion of the review of the Motor Industry Development Programme has led to untenable levels of uncertainty for local manufacturers hoping to win export contracts from their parent companies.

The World Bank's survey, *Doing Business 2008*, identified four areas in which South Africa was doing poorly in creating a business-friendly environment, including complicated processes for importing and exporting, the ease with which workers can be employed, the ease with which business properties are registered, and tax regulations. The Minister has partial or entire responsibility for all of these areas; yet no new proposals have been made during the year to resolve these issues.

The Department of Trade and Industry should be playing a hugely important role in the overall development of South Africa as a hub of economic growth and activity. For South Africans to have more jobs and more freedom to pursue their economic aspirations, tools to make it easy for them to do so need to be created and implemented. Government policies need to encourage access to investment in job-creating projects in as many areas of our economy as possible. But the Minister appears to have no real interest in giving these matters any attention, and seems to regard his position in the Cabinet as a comfortable retirement plan.

## **TRANSPORT**

### **Jeff Radebe – 4**

Outside of some positive 2010 World Cup initiatives in transport infrastructure, 2007/2008 saw Transport Minister Jeff Radebe's Department battle to bring together the important public transport linkages required to ensure the smooth and successful event that South Africa must make happen. Time is not on the Ministers' side if he is to pull this important planning and logistics component off within the 542 days remaining. His Department is still dogged with capacity problems with key staff having recently resigned and a continued vacancy rate of around 40% at senior management level.

The problem of the slowdown in delivery of the taxi recapitalization project to 8 000 units per annum, which effectively means that the state's target of 80 000 taxis over three years will now take 15 years, and the widening communication gap between taxi owners and the Department on their role in both event transport and the BRT activities in the host cities, is of major concern.

The Department sits with the major task of purchasing sufficient coaches and buses to cater for the World Cup in time and thereafter finding and training several thousand people to prepare, maintain and operate these newly purchased vehicles. The logistics of this exercise within the well known current administrative constraints of vehicle licencing, testing centres and the malfunctioning Operating Licencing Boards seems to be an insurmountable task under present conditions.

After a concerted Arrive Alive Campaign (which is now housed within the Road Traffic Management Corporation) and continued Road Safety checks along our roads and within our towns, the Department's objective of bringing down road deaths by 5% per annum has been finally reached. However nearly 15000 fatalities per annum is unacceptable knowing that unroadworthy vehicles and bad driver behavior continues unabated. Visible policing along the main road networks are still conspicuously absent and the long talked of National Highway patrols have never materialized.

The failure to resolve the sustainable funding of the technically insolvent RAF has caused endless hardship for the over 350 000 claimants sitting in the backlog and the recent moratorium on payments despite a further R2.5 billion cash injection caused further problems for claimants.

The Minister's failure to address this problem and find ways to implement the still to be proclaimed RAF Amendment Act reflects poorly on his ability to deal with the fund structure, the funding model and its ability to deal with its mounting backlogs estimated to be in excess of R30 billion.

His failure to respond to important letters written to him on this matter by members of the public or public representatives is a major weakness and shows disdain for accountability and openness.

Finally as more and more roads are handed over to SANRAL from the Provinces and no major injection of funding is projected into the Medium Term Expenditure funding plans, backlogs continue to mount above the conceded admitted amount of R50 billion on the National Road Network and R72 billion on the Provincial Road Network.

## **WATER & FORESTRY**

### **Lindiwe Hendricks 5**

This is the department which is responsible for the quality of water we drink and therefore plays a vital part in improving conditions for the people of South Africa. For the 2007/8 financial year it was allocated over R 5 billion and it received a qualified opinion from the Auditor-General.

In fact it has received qualified opinions from the A-G for the past three financial years.

For the current financial year, R44 million for the purchase of machinery and equipment could not be substantiated. A further 99 million for various other purposes could also not be substantiated.

The Department also has a high staff vacancy rate, including a 34% vacancy rate in water resources and management. This clearly compromises its ability to delivery on its mandates.

There is a general neglect of our rivers, underground aquifers, our dams are lacking in standard management and maintenance of municipal water and sewerage system is abhorrent.

This was demonstrated, for example, when 142 babies died from diarrhoea as a result of poor water quality in Sterkpruit and nearby Barkley in the Eastern Cape in April 2008. The Democratic Alliance has warned the department to attend to this crisis as a matter of urgency and we have seen only non-action and passionate denials of the gravity of the situation from officials.

If no action is taken these problems will be repeated in the Municipality of Makhado, where as result of the research done by the University of Venda, the water which is provided to the to the area was found during the year to be contaminated with e.coli.

This problem was further confirmed by the minister's admission in a recent address in Boksburg that 60% of facilities that treat sewage needed urgent intervention.

The Department had many problematic water boards under its stewardship and it is addressing those problems. It appears to have a plan to extricate some of the Water Boards from maladministration; for example Ikangala was disestablished in 2007 and Bushbuckridge restructured in 2008.

However many boards remain problematic, and although the minister has a mandate to intervene, she has not done enough.

The minister must be congratulated for the swift action she took by signing a R85 million water pipeline deal that will transport water to Delmas in Mpumalanga.

It must be remembered that there was a diarrhoea outbreak in the area last year which left about 1314 people ill.

The minister appointed a new Director-General in May 2008. The appointment of a CFO and qualified support staff will also help in addressing financial mismanagement and compliance with Acts. With this promise the DAI gives the minister 5/10 for her commitment to change and to make DWAF more efficient